

PROJECT MINUTES

Project:	W. Edward Balmer Elementary School Feasibility Study	Project No.:	17020
Prepared by:	Joel Seeley	Meeting Date:	3/6/18
Re:	CM Selection Committee Meeting	Meeting No:	5
Location:	High School Media Center	Time:	6:30pm
Distribution:	School Building Committee Members, Attendees (MF)		

Attendees:

PRESENT	NAME	AFFILIATION	
✓	Paul Bedigian	Representative of the Building, Planning, Construction Committee	
✓	Jeff Lundquist	Community Member with building design and/or construction experience	
✓	Andrew Chagnon	Community Member with building design and/or construction experience	
✓	Dr. Catherine Stickney	Superintendent of Schools	
✓	Lee Dore	D & W, Architect	
	Thomas Hengelsberg	D & W, Architect	
✓	Joel Seeley	SMMA, OPM	

Item #	Action	Discussion
5.1	Record	Call to Order, 6:30 PM, meeting opened.
5.2	Record	A motion was made by L. Dore and seconded by C. Stickney to approve the 2/14/18 CM Prequalification Committee meeting minutes. Motion passed unanimous by those attending, one abstention.
5.3	Committee	Each Committee member reviewed their evaluation of the submitted Proposal packages. Each member to submit their completed forms to J. Seeley for compilation.
5.4	J. Seeley	J. Seeley distributed and reviewed the RFP Interview Evaluation Forms, attached. The Committee reviewed the questions that each CM is to address in their presentation. J. Seeley to forward the questions to each CM firm to be interviewed.
5.5	Record	J. Seeley distributed and reviewed the CM Price Proposal Evaluation, attached.
5.6	Record	CM Interviews are Scheduled for: March 14, 2018 at 5:30 pm at the High School Media Center.
5.7	Record	Next CM Selection Committee: March 17, 2018 at 8:00 am at the District Offices.
5.8	Record	A Motion was made by L. Dore and seconded by P. Bedigian to adjourn the meeting. No discussion, motion passed unanimous.

Attachments: Agenda, RFP Interview Evaluation Forms, CM Price Proposal Evaluation

The information herein reflects the understanding reached. Please contact the author if you have any questions or are not in agreement with these Project Minutes

JGS/sat/P:\2017\17020\04-MEETINGS\4.3 Mtg_Notes\3-CM Selection Committee\5-6March2018_Cmselectioncte\Cmselectioncommitteemeeting_6March2018_FINAL.Docx

PROJECT MEETING SIGN-IN SHEET

Project: W. Edward Balmer Elementary School Feasibility Study
Prepared by: Joel Seeley
Re: CM Selection Subcommittee Meeting
Location: High School Media Center
427 Linwood Avenue, Whitinsville, MA

Project No.: 17020
Meeting Date: 3/6/2018
Meeting No: 5
Time: 6:30pm

Distribution: Attendees, (MF)

[illegible]

p:\2017\17020\04-meetings\4.3 mtg_notes\3-cm prequalification committee\5-6march2018_cm\prequal\cm\prequalcommittee\meetings\sign-in sheet_6march2018.docx

Agenda

Project:	W. Edward Balmer Elementary School Feasibility Study	Project No.:	17020
Re:	CM Selection Subcommittee Meeting	Meeting Date:	3/6/2018
Meeting Location:	High School Media Center	Meeting Time:	6:30 PM
	427 Linwood Avenue, Whitinsville, MA	Meeting No.	5
Prepared by:	Joel G. Seeley		
Distribution:	Committee Members (MF)		

1. Call to Order
2. Review CM Proposals
3. Next Meeting: March 14, 2018
4. Adjourn

1000 Massachusetts Avenue
Cambridge, MA 02138
617.547.5400

www.smma.com

RFP INTERVIEW EVALUATION CRITERIA

FINAL RANKING

Evaluator: _____

- **Communication:**
- **Project Team Chemistry:**
- **Project Leadership:**
- **Project Approach – PreConstruction:**
- **Project Approach – Construction:**
- **Budget and Cost Control:**
- **Quality Control:**
- **Answers to All 4 Questions:**

CONSIGLI	FONTAINE	GILBANE	W.T. RICH

OVERALL RATING

RATING: 1 = Least Advantageous 2 = Advantageous 3 = Most Advantageous
--

RFP INTERVIEW EVALUATION CRITERIA

CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT FIRM: _____

- Communication:
- Project Team Chemistry:
- Project Leadership:
- Project Approach – PreConstruction:
- Project Approach – Construction:
- Budget and Cost Control:
- Quality Control:
- Answers to All 4 Questions:

RATING

OVERALL RATING

RATING: 1 = Least Advantageous 2 = Advantageous 3 = Most Advantageous

Questions:

RATING

- 1 What do you see as the most important challenge for the project?

NOTES:

- 2 How will you add value to promoting the project to the community prior to the Town vote?

NOTES:

- 3 Tell us what you think would be opportunities for cost savings?

NOTES:

- 4 How will you ensure there will be no interruption to education in the existing W. Edward Balmer Elementary School?

NOTES:

RFP INTERVIEW EVALUATION CRITERIA

CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT FIRM: _____

- 5 What is your constructability review process and deliverable during each design phase?**

NOTES:

RATING

- 6 What will be your process for controlling contractor traffic from interrupting school and neighborhood traffic?**

NOTES:

--

DRAFT

RFP INTERVIEW - OPTIONAL QUESTIONS

- 1 Tell us about your similar projects and how they relate to our project.**
- 2 Tell us how your staff's experience will benefit our project.**
- 3 How will you ensure quality throughout the construction?**
- 4 Tell us how you ensure all approved Design Phase LEED credits will be obtained?**
- 5 How do you ensure there will be no gaps between Early Packages and Final Documents?**
- 6 What is your process for managing holds, allowances and contingencies?**
- 7 How will you handle on-site traffic and parking concerns from the staff and the public?**
- 8 How will you handle neighborhood traffic concerns?**
- 9 How will you manage a non-performing subcontractor?**
- 10 Give us some good examples of Value Engineering for a project like ours.**
- 11 What is the main differentiator of your firm from the other firms?**

CM AT RISK PROPOSAL EVALUATION
W. EDWARD BALMER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL, WHITINSVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS

PROJECT MANAGEMENT

SMMA

3/1/2018

CM Price Proposal Analysis - Summary

		PSR Budget	Consigli	Fontaine	Gilbane	WT Rich
Pre-Construction Services	Code					
Pre-Construction Services	B.1		\$ 238,400	\$ 250,000	\$ 300,000	\$ 144,181
Sub-total		\$ 950,000	\$ 238,400	\$ 250,000	\$ 300,000	\$ 235,000
Construction						
Project Management Labor	C.1	below	\$ 2,812,007	\$ 1,682,475	\$ 2,315,563	\$ 2,054,400
Field Supervisory Labor	C.2	below	\$ 1,938,642	\$ 1,170,000	\$ 1,196,535	\$ 2,067,410
Sub-total		\$ 4,320,000	\$ 4,750,649	\$ 2,852,475	\$ 3,512,098	\$ 4,121,810
Consultant Labor	C.3		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
P&P Bonds	C.4	\$ 690,230	\$ 610,899	\$ 566,100	\$ 522,930	\$ 488,720
Insurance	C.4	\$ 1,207,902	\$ 990,258	\$ 887,840	\$ 821,780	\$ 548,470
Sub-total		\$ 1,898,132	\$ 1,601,157	\$ 1,453,940	\$ 1,344,710	\$ 1,037,190
Trailers, Supplies etc.	C.5	above	\$ 351,389	\$ 301,400	\$ 429,440	\$ 258,000
Additional Costs	C.6	above	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Sub-total			\$ 351,389	\$ 301,400	\$ 429,440	\$ 258,000
Cost of Work Items	C.7		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Sub-total	C.8	\$ 6,218,132	\$ 6,703,195	\$ 4,607,815	\$ 5,286,248	\$ 5,417,000
CM Fee						
CM Fee			\$ 1,791,970	\$ 1,625,000	\$ 1,714,384	\$ 1,630,000
Sub-total		\$ 2,070,690	\$ 1,791,970	\$ 1,625,000	\$ 1,714,384	\$ 1,630,000
Total		\$ 9,238,822	\$ 8,733,565	\$ 6,482,815	\$ 7,300,632	\$ 7,282,000

Notes

1. Fontaine PA, AP/AR, Contracts, Compliance \$87,075 costs moved to Project Management Labor from Consultants
2. Gilbane reported total is \$7,264,872. The correct total is \$7,300,632, there is a \$35,760 mistake on their summary page.
3. WT Rich Labor Foreman \$221,850 costs moved to Field Supervisory Labor from Consultants
4. Fontaine cost based on commencing construction Nov 2019 in lieu of June 2019
5. Gilbane cost based on completing New Building Feb 2021 in lieu of June 2021

3/1/2018

CM Price Proposal Analysis - Construction Labor

		Consigli	Fontaine	Gilbane	WT Rich
Construction					
Project Management Labor C.1					
Principal in Charge		included	included	\$ -	\$ 87,000
Project Executive		\$ 230,104	\$ 153,000	\$ 371,766	\$ 143,750
Senior Project Manager		\$ -	\$ 619,200	\$ 551,488	\$ 230,000
Senior Project Manager -Ph2		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 31,500
Project Manager		\$ 759,810	\$ 469,200	\$ -	\$ 612,000
Asst. Project Manager		\$ 601,340	\$ 170,400	\$ -	\$ 417,300
Asst. Project Manager		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 299,000
Project Engineer		\$ 620,140	\$ -	\$ 368,081	in Field Staff
Asst. Project Engineer		\$ -	\$ -	\$ 296,929	\$ -
Environmental Manager		\$ -	\$ -	\$ 7,578	\$ -
Quality Manager		\$ -	\$ -	\$ 7,787	\$ 69,000
LEED Coordinator		\$ 27,674	included	\$ -	by PM
MEP Coordinator		\$ -	\$ 74,700	\$ -	\$ -
Project Accountant		\$ 163,830	\$ 33,750	\$ 292,653	\$ 45,500
Project Intern		\$ -	\$ -	\$ 120,704	\$ -
Administrative Assistant		\$ 29,830	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 32,500
Cost Control Engineer		By PM	\$ -	\$ 85,657	by PM
CORI Management/Badge Coordinator		by Assist Super	included	\$ -	\$ 23,850
Scheduler		\$ 77,400	\$ 45,000	\$ 89,666	\$ 63,000
BIM		\$ 40,377	\$ 63,900	\$ 100,956	in Field Staff
Information Technology		\$ 105,622	\$ -	\$ 8,623	included
Purchasing Agent		\$ 113,880	\$ -	\$ -	by PM
Accounts Payable		\$ -	\$ 18,900	\$ 13,675	
Compliance/Outreach Officer		\$ 42,000	\$ 18,225		
Contracts & Insurance			\$ 16,200		
Sub-total		\$ 2,812,007	\$ 1,682,475	\$ 2,315,563	\$ 2,054,400
Field Supervisory Labor C.2					
General Superintendent		\$ 117,600	\$ -	\$ 346,256	\$ -
Superintendent		\$ 834,244	\$ 690,000	\$ 392,341	\$ 680,000
Asst. Superintendent		\$ 671,960	\$ 399,000	\$ -	\$ 414,000
Asst. Superintendent		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 400,000
MEP Coordinator / Commissioning Assistant		\$ 183,438	included in C1	\$ 321,112	\$ 195,500
Safety Engineer		\$ 43,800	\$ 81,000	\$ 136,826	\$ 156,060
CORI Implementation		included	included	\$ -	\$ -
Quality Manager		\$ 87,600	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Labor Foreman		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 221,850
Sub-total		\$ 1,938,642	\$ 1,170,000	\$ 1,196,535	\$ 2,067,410
Total		\$ 4,750,649	\$ 2,852,475	\$ 3,512,098	\$ 4,121,810

Notes

1. Fontaine PA, AP/AR, Contracts, Compliance \$87,075 costs moved to Project Management Labor from Consultants
2. WT Rich Labor Foreman \$221,850 costs moved to Field Supervisory Labor from Consultants

3/1/2018

CM Price Proposal Analysis - Additional General Conditions

		Consigli	Fontaine	Gilbane	WT Rich
Construction					
Trailers, Supplies Etc. C.5					
Town of Northbridge, OPM and Architect Temporary Office Trailers (minimum 12x60 with working toilet)		\$ 33,600	\$ 29,100	\$ 55,400	\$ 21,000
Town of Northbridge, OPM and Architect Telephone, high speed internet line and wireless internet connection and Usage Charges (including long distance)		\$ 24,633	\$ 8,400	\$ 32,240	\$ 9,000
Town of Northbridge, OPM and Architect Office Furniture		\$ 6,000	\$ 25,000	\$ 9,600	\$ 15,000
Cleaning of Town of Northbridge and Architect Trailers		\$ -	\$ 8,400	\$ 15,320	\$ 12,000
CM Temporary Office Trailers		\$ 88,800	\$ 29,100	\$ 55,400	\$ 45,000
CM Telephone and Internet Service, Equipment and Usage Charges (including long distance)		\$ 49,267	\$ 14,000	\$ 36,840	\$ 9,000
CM Office Furniture		\$ 7,500	\$ 20,000	\$ 15,850	\$ 12,000
Cleaning of CM Trailers		\$ -	\$ 8,400	\$ 15,320	\$ 12,000
Travel, Meals, etc...		\$ -	\$ 20,000	\$ 27,600	\$ 9,000
LEEDS Supervision and Assistance Implementation (Field)		included	included	included	included
Information Technology (I.T.) Time (Field Office)		\$ 35,950	\$ 15,000	\$ -	\$ 6,000
Computers & Software		\$ 81,319	\$ 15,000	\$ 43,450	\$ 12,000
Field Office Supplies		\$ 18,000	\$ 19,000	\$ 41,370	\$ 9,000
Site Security Services		\$ -	cost of work	\$ 15,000	\$ 12,000
On-Site Storage Containers		\$ -	\$ 5,600	\$ -	\$ 9,000
Small Tools		\$ -	\$ 5,600	\$ 13,800	\$ 18,000
Safety Materials (Safety Kit)		\$ -	\$ 14,000	\$ 28,700	\$ 9,000
Photos		\$ -	\$ 21,600	\$ 4,600	\$ 6,000
Reprographics		\$ 6,320	\$ 8,400	\$ -	\$ 10,500
Postage, Shipping, Courier Services, etc...		\$ -	\$ 2,800	\$ 9,200	\$ 9,000
Management of Plans, Specifications, etc...		\$ -	included	\$ 2,000	included
Record Drawings		\$ -	included	\$ 5,750	\$ 9,000
Punch List		\$ -	included	included	included
Photo ID Badge Machine		\$ -	\$ 12,000	\$ 2,000	\$ 4,500
Other		\$ -	\$ 20,000	\$ -	\$ -
Sub-total		\$ 351,389	\$ 301,400	\$ 429,440	\$ 258,000
Additional General Conditions C.6					
		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Sub-total		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Total		\$ 351,389	\$ 301,400	\$ 429,440	\$ 258,000